

Historians of Islamic Art Third Biennial Symposium :
Looking Widely, Looking Closely

Speaker Abstracts as of July 2, 2012

FRIDAY, OCTOBER 19

Session 1

Formation and Transformation in Umayyad Art

Chair and Discussant, *Finbarr Barry Flood*

Nadia Ali

Max-Planck/KHI Fellow

The South Arabian Component of Umayyad Royal Iconography

In the last thirty years, the field of Arabian archaeology (especially in South Arabia) has grown significantly but historians of early Islamic art still hesitate to explore the extraordinary vacuum that exists in our knowledge of the relationships between the civilizations of pre-Islamic Arabia and the development of Early Islamic art. In order to fill the gap, I will take a closer look at the visual culture of the kingdom of Himyar which ruled South Arabia and parts of central Arabia from the 3rd to the 6th century. By exploiting conjointly the figurative remains of the himyarite capital of Zafar, the epigraphical material and Arabic written sources, I will argue that South Arabia did not only pave the way for the Umayyads' adoption of a late antique repertory, but may also have been a pourveyor of visual models and practices. In turn, this line of inquiry may help to revise the false dichotomy established by the canon between the late antique sources of Umayyad royal iconography and an often essentialized Arab background assumed to be nomadic and isolated from the rest of the world civilization prior to the rise of Islam.

Donald Whitcomb

The Oriental Institute
University of Chicago

Khirbet al-Mafjar or Qasr Hisham? Changing Perceptions of a Palestinian Monument

The Umayyad palace complex of Khirbet al-Mafjar, located near Jericho, is the most important cultural symbol of the early Islamic period for Palestine, comparable to Samarra in Iraq and Fustat in Egypt. The archaeological site was excavated by Dimitri Baramki in the 1930s and its architecture published by R. W. Hamilton in 1959. This was under the British mandate and Hamilton went on to create an interpretation involving the caliphate of Walid II.

The monument is popularly known now as Qasr Hisham, based on very minimal historical evidence. In winter of 2011, new archaeological excavations began as a joint project of the Palestinian Department of Antiquities and the University of Chicago. These continued in 2012 with discoveries providing a new set of interpretations for this monument.

This paper will outline the background and milieu of the archaeology of Baramki and suggest some origins for Hamilton's model of the site. This will be contrasted with the current state of archaeology in Palestine and the need for new explanatory models. Among the significant discoveries are structures which provide a transition to the northern region of the site, a little known complex of the same periods until the present fieldwork. Some very preliminary ideas may be offered toward the development of a new model for Khirbet al-Mafjar/Qasr Hisham.

Theodore Van Loan

Graduate Student/ Ph.D. Candidate

University of Pennsylvania

Umar's Bargain: Skirting Litholatry at the Dome of the Rock

The title of this paper refers to a tradition in the *Ṣaḥīḥ* of Bukhārī which tells of a bargain made between the caliph 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb and the Black Stone of the Ka'ba. Addressing the stone directly, 'Umar denies its supernatural powers, yet calls for his followers to revere it, as the Prophet Muḥammad had in the past. 'Umar skirts the charge of litholatry by exorcising sacrality from the visible object and transferring it to the abstract act of prophetic veneration. These dictates demand a sacred gaze that denies the efficacy of contemplating the physical object before the viewer's eyes. I contend that this denial is articulated by a repeated motif within in the Dome of the Rock's mosaic program. The argument hinges upon a resemblance between the golden stars inscribed within black circles, located at the tops of the arches of the interior arcade, and a black stone, currently set into a flat *mihrab* in the cave under the rock.

The visual similarities and differences between the motifs in the mosaics and the stone reveal a complex system of signification. The relationship is not strictly mimetic, as the stars possess varying numbers of rays, for the most part not corresponding to the eight inscribed in the black stone. Thus, the forms in the mosaic program were created to represent the sight of the stone rather than the stone itself. In creating representations that are unconcerned with exact replication, the Umayyad-era image-makers have adhered to 'Umar's bargain by not honoring the exact physical attributes of the stone.

There are three common understandings of the Dome of the Rock mosaics: decorative, iconographic/evocative, and phenomenal (i.e. they, along with the architecture and epigraphy, constitute a cohesive and perceivable environment). I will add a fourth; that the mosaics serve a didactic function; as a kind of visual treatise which reveals a complex understanding of visual representation.

Session 2

Form and Meaning in Arabic, Persian and Indian Manuscripts

Chair and Discussant, *Massumeh Farhad*

Jaclynne J. Kerner

Assistant Professor of Art History
State University of New York at New Paltz

Art and Artifice in the Illustrated Herbal of al-Ghāfiqī (Montréal, Osler Library of the History of Medicine, OL 7508)

William Osler, the renowned Canadian-born physician, professor of medicine, and bibliophile, purchased a pair of densely illustrated, thirteenth-century Arabic herbals in 1912. A century later, the manuscripts' story is still unfolding.

The codices, which were marketed as an Arabic translation of the *De materia medica* of Dioscorides in two volumes, are today housed in libraries on opposite sides of the Atlantic Ocean. The cataloguer of Osler's collection discovered that the first volume was not the work of the Greek botanist. Rather, its text comprises roughly half of a treatise long thought to have been lost — the *Book of Simple Drugs* (*Kitāb fī al-adwiya al-mufrada*) of the Cordoban physician Abū Jaʿfar Aḥmad al-Ghāfiqī (d. 560/1165). Osler had willed his two-volume “Dioscorides” to the Bodleian Library, but bequeathed the bulk of his library to McGill University in Montréal. The reattribution of the al-Ghāfiqī manuscript allowed it to be claimed for the recently established Osler Library of the History of Medicine (OL 7508). The Dioscorides volume entered, and remains part of, the Bodleian's collection (MS. Arab. d. 138).

A facsimile edition of the illustrated al-Ghāfiqī manuscript and a volume of interpretive essays are currently in press. The manuscript has otherwise received scant attention from historians of Islamic art despite its probable distinction as the sole surviving illustrated copy of al-Ghāfiqī's treatise datable to the pre-Mongol period. This paper seeks to redress the situation by assessing the manuscript as an illustrated herbal in the Greco-Arabic tradition, exploring its relationship to better-known manuscripts, and reevaluating its longstanding attribution to the “Baghdad School.”

The artificial but convincing “pairing” of two contemporary herbals constitute this paper's secondary theme. Later additions and alterations, such as “Western” leather covers, will be examined in the context of the commodification of Islamic manuscripts in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Eloïse Brac de la Perriere

Associate Professor - Islamic Arts
Université de la Sorbonne – Paris IV
Institut d'art et d'archéologie

A Set of Unexplored Manuscripts: Bihari Writing Korans in Sultanate India

Although we are used to meet them regularly in exhibitions or auctions, Bihari writing Korans produced in India between the fourteenth century and the sixteenth century are still hardly known and never studied as a whole. As they almost never include any colophons or other sufficient information to identify the source and date of execution, and as their pages are often dispersed in various collections, many of their attributions are still unfounded and sometimes quite fanciful. This production however has the distinctive feature of displaying a rare homogeneity for this period in India. It appears through both codicological and ornamental characteristics, but also through the nature of writing pieces: Koranic texts accompanied by glosses and other very remarkable textual tools, directly related to the conduct of the recitation.

The harmony of this group of manuscripts written probably in different places over a period covering nearly three centuries, points out fundamental issues in the context of production, patronage, craftsmen and recipients. The graphic unity shown by these Korans through the use of bihari style and the uniform layout, have of course to be questioned. This unity may appear to be offset by the illuminations styles which are often disparate and always original, but a close examination shows once again an obvious coherence. An ornamental analysis may then permit to establish subgroups sufficiently homogeneous to think of a rational subdivision of bihari writing manuscripts. The iconographic study of illuminations highlights deep links with Persian arts of the book during dynasties considered minor, such as Muzaffarides. These links logically emphasize a new relationship between artistic pre-Mughal India and production centers such as Shiraz.

Ayşe Pinar Gokpınar

PhD Candidate
Institute of Fine Arts, NYU

The Concept of Time and Space: Understanding Temporality in the Representations of the Topkapı Persian Falnama (TSM H.1702)

Produced around the time of the Islamic millennium (1000AH/1561-62AD) a group of illustrations in the *Falnama*¹ auguries focuses on eschatological themes, such as signs of the Apocalypse and the Judgment Day. It is likely that the artists portrayed a contemporary perception of what the future would hold and what was expected to happen. Among the copies of the *Falnama*, the Topkapı Persian *Falnama* (TSM H.1702)² is

¹ The Falnama, or the Book of Omens, is an illustrated text that was intended to be used for prognostication throughout the Islamic world in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.

² Created in the last quarter of the sixteenth century, the manuscript entered the Ottoman royal collection before the reign of Ahmed III (r.1703-30). It is a volume of fifty-nine folios with paintings and situates text

unique for its explicit relationship between the Qur'an and the manuscript's images. With its heterodox nature and the sequential order of the themes, this manuscript has already been understood as a representation of Shi'i cosmological view. However, previous scholarly interpretations have failed to recognize the degree to which this manuscript reflects a broader understanding of temporality within the Shi'i cosmological view.

The Topkapı Persian *Falnama* has two pictorial cycles: the creation of heavens; and the Apocalypse.³ Although it is true that the manuscript is inspired by Shi'i doctrine, I would like to take that argument a step further. While this paper closely analyzes the pictorial program of the manuscript; in order to develop a wider framework, I propose that the manuscript is not only Shi'i, but furthermore, that its perspective has had broader, formal as well as conceptual implications for other *Falnama* copies.

In order to analyze how the concept of time and space was perceived in the manuscript, first, I will stress the understanding of temporality by looking at representations of the Judgment Day and its apocalyptic signs in the Topkapı Persian *Falnama*. These observations will lead the paper into a conclusion that the sequential order of the two cycles (the creation and the destruction of the earth) had an implicit impact on the representations of its figures – repeating figures being portrayed differently depending on a shift in time from the beginning to the end of the earth and a shift in space from terrestrial to extra-terrestrial.

Second, by analyzing both the stylistic and iconographic similarities, I will compare Topkapı Persian *Falnama* to other copies of *Falnama* to determine whether they contain different definitions of temporality and understandings of space and time. These definitions will suggest reconsideration of the original orders of these manuscripts and their selection of scenes derived from the political, religious and cultural environment in which each was produced.

and image on the same page, directly relating Qur'anic verses to a particular subject appearing above a painting and a pair of couplets that introduces the nature of the augury appearing below it. Aside from Topkapı Persian *Falnama* (TSM H. 1702), three monumental copies of *Falnama* produced during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries survive: the Dispersed *Falnama*, the Dresden *Falnama* (E.445), and the *Falnama* of Ahmed I (TSM H.1703)

³Farhad, Massumeh and Serpil Bağcı. *Falnama: The Book of Omens*. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institute, 2009, pp.53-59

Session 3

On Paper, Poetry and Painting

Chair and Discussant, *Eleanor Sims*

Jake Benson

Curator, Thesaurus Islamicus Foundation Dar al-Kutub Manuscript Project (TIF-DAK)

Naqsh Bar Āb: Safavid Marbled Papers of the Late 16th to Early 17th centuries

Certain Safavid manuscripts, such as a copy of Farīd al-Dīn 'Attār's *Manṭiq al-Ṭayr* (MMA 63.210.35), and a double-page illustration of *The Princely Hawking Party* attributed to Mīrzā 'Alī (MMA2.223.1 and MFA14.624), are embellished with marbled paper borders with quite different stylistic features. The evolution of these decorative papers resulted from exchanges between artists regarding their methods, materials, as well as their individual talents and tastes. Additionally, these papers not only document the evolution of the art of marbling, but also demonstrate the extent to which members of the Safavid ruling elite deliberately fostered this trend in Iran.

The marbled pattern surrounding *The Princely Hawking Party* dating to approximately 1570 CE is comparatively primitive, with pale and diffuse colors, and yet it also cleverly connects with the marginal painting of the inner border at specific intervals. A comparison of these inner and outer borders reveals that painted elements were consciously based on the contours of the surrounding marbled pattern. Streams of water merge with the marbling, proving that the latter was intentionally considered as an element of the entire composition when it was originally executed.

In contrast, gold-flecked marbled borders were added to the *Manṭiq al-Ṭayr*, when the manuscript was refurbished in Isfahan around 1600 CE. These leaves feature a vivid array of colorful patterns that also provide a striking contrast to the rest of the manuscript. Two surviving letters addressed to Mīr Muḥammad Ṭāhir, a Persian marbling artist living in India, sheds light upon why this choice was made. The letters, written by the artists Mullā Khalīl Vaqqārī and Yahyā Qazvīnī (the latter a paper marbler mentioned by Qāzī Aḥmad Qummī in his *Gulistān-i Hunar*), relate their enthusiastic reaction to seeing Muḥammad Ṭāhir's work. These artistic exchanges in Iran and India confirm how the art of marbling evolved.

Fateme Montazeri

Graduate Theological Union

Sermon in the Mosque or Socio-Religious Critique?

An illustration from a sixteenth-century Iranian manuscript of Hafez's collected works shows an unprecedented and rather curious subject: "hypocrisy." Signed by Sheikh Zadeh, it shows the elaborately decorated interior of a mosque with groups of men attending a sermon given by a preacher addressing them from a pulpit above. The

inscriptions in the illustration quote poems by Hafez on pretentious preachers who do not practice what they preach.

Scholars have long praised the formal features of the illustration, recognizing it as a masterpiece of Persian painting. Focusing on particular elements of the painting, they give it different titles that reflect their varied readings. While there is a consensus that the manuscript belongs to the reign of Shah Tahmasp (1514-1576), scholars differ in their proposed production dates, ranging from 1510 to 1540. The significance of the production dates relate to the Shah's approach toward the arts. Young Tahmasp was once a great supporter of artists; yet, having a dream in 1532, as he in his memoir and other historic accounts narrate, he became increasingly devout. The 'ulema then took on dominant roles in society—a fact that well resonates with the subject of the painting.

The reasons for the appearance of this curious subject for the first time under Shah Tahmasp have yet to be sufficiently examined. This study considers the social conditions that underlie the selection of this poem for illustration. Bridging the socio-historical and artistic contexts, it examines whether the selection and illustration of this poem might be considered the artistic statement of an objection to the new religious structure of society. This argument, in broader perspective, allows us to re-examine the extent to which Islamic painting, known for its idealistic approach, was at times sensitive to social developments.

Emily Neumeier

University of Pennsylvania

An Anatolian Mont Sainte-Victoire: Approaching Modern Turkish Painting

The Liberation of Manisa (ca. 1960) by Cemal Tollu serves as a case study for investigating the attitudes towards citing and assimilating European painting in Turkey's art historical discourse. Tollu's painting commemorates an event that took place during the Turkish War of Independence, yet it also makes visual references to works with their own history and geography, particularly the landscapes of Paul Cézanne and Eugène Delacroix's *Massacres of Chios*. In effect, the artist stitches these disparate elements together and re-inscribes them as a distinctive moment in his own country's revolutionary history.

As a key part of Turkey's nationalist rhetoric was establishing cultural autonomy from Europe, the development of a local idiom of art-making in the formal language of French painting stood as a difficult proposition. This paper will explore how Cemal Tollu and his milieu set out to justify the act of citation itself as well as rediscover the elements that they admired most in modernist painting—the geometricization and solidity of bodies and forms—in local traditions such as Hittite art and architecture. Tollu's writings in the Istanbul newspaper *Yeni Sabah*, invaluable sources of information relating to the artist's theory and practice, inform the present analysis.

Session 4

Medieval Identities and Beyond

Panel Chair and Discussant, *Eva R. Hoffman*

This session will bring together medievalists from ICMA and HIAA to explore issues of cultural exchange in the realms of European, Byzantine, and Islamic art and to share multiple perspectives of scholars in these fields. Two pairs of specialists in European, Byzantine and Islamic art will examine shared works and themes that appear across these disciplines. By looking closely, each paper will shed light on the particular contexts of the studied work. By looking widely, the papers collectively will allow us consider these works within their broader medieval contexts and beyond. Through these collaborative efforts of close study and wider perspectives, it will be possible to work toward a fuller and more integrated understanding of medieval art.

Amanda Luyster and Mika Natif

Kalila Two Ways: East and West

Our papers examine two illustrated manuscripts of the famous animal fables known as Kalila and Dimna: one, translated into Latin, was produced in fourteenth-century France; the other was rendered in Persian and illustrated at the Mughal court in the late sixteenth-century, Lahore. This unlikely pairing of two royal commissions reveals interesting features regarding the conceptualization of identities at the different courts and may offer rich insight into various portrayals of dynastic authority and self-representation.

Part I: West

Amanda Luyster

College of the Holy Cross

Those who are familiar with the collection of tales known as the Kalila wa Dimna (popular in Arabic, Persian, and Turkish, among other languages), might be surprised to encounter the variant in Paris BN Latin 8504. In that translation, Burzuya, the traveling physician, prays to the Virgin Mary, dreams of Christ surrounded by angels, witnesses the Annunciation, and sees himself miraculously in the company of the Virgin and her infant Son. This finely-illuminated Latin translation, executed by the physician Raymond de Beziens for the French king in 1313, has remained relatively neglected by scholars except for its two prefatory folios. These show the French royal family participating in the events of Pentecost in 1313 and therefore represent the earliest “historical” depiction in France. The following miniatures, approximately 140, all depict the Kalila wa Dimna. What is the connection between the Kalila wa Dimna and this representation of “history” and the French king? And why, indeed, does Burzuya have a vision of the Virgin Mary?

I argue that Paris Latin 8504 was intended to present new material, which was considered amusing and diverting, but also to situate that new material within more familiar frameworks of religion, knowledge, and history. This introduction of the new into familiar frameworks occurs in three ways: the Christianization of Burzuya through prayer and Christian visions, the appearance of the historical French court in the prefatory

section, and the textual addition of maxims from the grammar school tradition (these additions are so numerous that they nearly double the length of the manuscript). In his presentation of the manuscript to the French court, Raymond repeats the actions of Burzuya, who brings the tales back to his own king: thereby Raymond inscribes himself in yet another frame story, with hopes, one imagines, of securing for his own name a similar immortality as that enjoyed by the ever-changing Kalila wa Dimna.

Part II: East

Mika Natif

Harvard University Art Museums

The book of *Kalila wa Dimna* was translated into Persian several times. In the Timurid period, Kashifi was commissioned by Amir Suhayli to rewrite these stories in an up-to-date language, and the work was titled *Anvar-i Suhayli* (Lights of Canopus or Suhayl). Using Ibn al-Muqaffa's Arabic narratives of *Kalila wa Dimna* as well as the Persian translation by Abu al-Ma'ali Nasr Allah, Kashifi produced a florid Persian text that was illustrated several times by the Mughals in India. However, Emperor Akbar, who disliked the ornate style of the *Anwār-i Suhaylī*, ordered his vizier, Abu'l Fazl, to write yet another edition of the work – the *'Iyār-i Dānish* (completed in 996/1578). This version of the text was illustrated by artists at the royal atelier in 1596-7. Recognized as one of the masterpieces produced at Akbar's *kitabkhana* in Lahore, the *Iyar-i Danish* manuscript (now in Varanasi, Bharat Kala Bhavan, Ms.9069) demonstrates the sophistication of upper class Mughal society and its literati nobility in the 1590s. Scholars believe that the twenty-five illustrations served a didactic purpose, since the text belongs to the genre of "Mirror for Princes." However, the illustrations seem too sophisticated and complicated to be aimed solely at the education of a young person. In fact, their subject matter, as well as their complexity, represents a shift in the development of Mughal aesthetics and visual identity. Two visual landmarks that emerge are the artists' growing interest in three-dimensionality and their attention to portraiture.

Robert G. Ousterhout

Professor, University of Pennsylvania

From Hagia Sophia to Ayasofya: Architecture and the Persistence of Memory

In Istanbul, it constitutes a radical political statement to call the city Constantinople. While other nations and capitals used their pasts to forge modern identities, the pre-Ottoman past of Istanbul continues to stand in dramatic opposition to the present, doubly tainted by its Hellenism and its Christianity. Rather than providing validation or symbolic underpinnings, it could only serve to empower a ruling regime (whether late Ottoman or Republican) by remaining conquered – that is, if its churches continue to function as mosques and its spaces of power remain unexplored. In this paper I propose to contrast attitudes toward the Byzantine past of Constantinople in the 15th century, following the Conquest, and the 20th century, following the foundation of the Republic. My focus will be on the contemporary discourses surrounding the conversions of Hagia Sophia from church to mosque and from mosque to museum. In neither

instance did the building undergo a radical physical transformation, as did the Great Mosque at Cordoba, although in both the 15th and the 20th centuries, its history was rewritten to resonate within a transformed present.

D. Fairchild Ruggles

Professor, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

Islamic Monuments and National Patrimony in Modern Spain

The present remembers the past in order to understand itself. But the self-knowledge that springs from history can require delicate negotiations when the archaeology and history of monuments from the past do not accord with present identities. As a result, architectural stewardship can be fraught with nationalist tension. In Spain, the Islamic past usefully differentiates Iberia from the rest of Europe, and its monuments—particularly the Great Mosque of Cordoba and the Alhambra—are a source of pride. However, the Islamic past is treated as “distant.” The modern nation, which coalesced in the moment that the last Muslim stronghold of Granada was conquered and the expulsions begun, regards Islam as a fascinating chapter in a book that otherwise begins and ends with Christianity. In contrast, in modern Turkey it is the Christian past that is problematic for the present nation that either insists on secularism or publically claims Islam. Byzantine history is treated gingerly as a “distant” past that must be dealt with without being embraced. In both environments, Spain and Turkey, the current national identity has to find a careful balance between the celebration and repression of difference as emblemized in major national monuments.

SATURDAY, OCTOBER 20th

Session 5

From Mosques to Mosaic and Mirrors : Islamic Architecture and its Decoration

Panel Chair and Discussant, *Sheila Blair*

Ruba Kana'an

Head of Education and Scholarly Programmes

The Aga Khan Museum, Toronto, Canada

The Friday Mosque Revisited: the Meaning, Function, and Evolution of an Architectural Paradigm

Current archaeological and art historical research on mosques focuses predominantly on building typology and architectural style as well as the relationship between architectural patronage, visual symbolism, and political power. The function of the mosque and its meaning to worshipers are not central to the scholarly debate. Nor, for that matter, is the relationship between prayer and mosques.

Jacob Lassner (1967), Oleg Grabar (1969), and Ernest Hertzfeld (1942-48) have raised questions about the function of the mosque and probed its meaning to a given city. Yet these questions seem not to have generated further art historical interest. As a result, the fact that the Great Umayyad mosque of Damascus remained the only Friday mosque in the city until the establishment of the Hanbalite mosque in the Salihyya quarter in the thirteenth century, or the limited number of Friday mosques in Muslim cities prior to the Ottoman period remained unquestioned. If we understand the Friday mosques to be the central emblem of Muslim religiosity, how can we explain their sporadic presence in Muslim medieval cities?

Mosque architecture itself is not the focus of Muslim historical discourse, yet a broad range of legal, historical, and didactic textual sources dealing with prayer in general, and the Friday prayer in particular, provide a valuable insight into how mosques were perceived and used. This rich textual discourse is the focus of this paper with the purpose of re-examining the paradigmatic understanding of mosque architecture and the evolution of its meaning and function. Taking a *longue durée* approach and a broad geographical perspective, the paper will examine Friday mosques in specific contexts and the textual discourse relevant to them highlighting the issues, concerns and principles involved in the Muslim understanding of the Friday prayer and the Friday mosques, and broadening the art historical debate about them.

Chanchal Dadlani

Assistant Professor of Art History
Wake Forest University

Orthodoxy and Aesthetics in Mughal Architecture: The Moti Masjid of 'Alamgir I'

In the Mughal palace complex of Delhi is a small marble mosque that exhibits a remarkably ornate sensibility, its surfaces carved and inlaid with floral and geometric motifs, its piers and arches richly sculpted, and its architectonic and ornamental elements seamlessly integrated. The Moti Masjid, or “Pearl Mosque” (1663 CE) was commissioned by ‘Alamgir I (r. 1658-1707 CE, and more popularly known as Aurangzeb). In focusing on the Moti Masjid, this paper considers the relationship between religious orthodoxy, aesthetic values, and artistic production in the Mughal empire. I argue that rather than serving as an impediment, the cultivation of an orthodox Sunni identity drove the development of a sophisticated and focused visual program during the early years of the reign of ‘Alamgir I. My analysis of the mosque, in conjunction with sources from the period and comparative examples, demonstrates that ‘Alamgir I viewed the regulation of the cultural realm as integral to the enforcement of his religious and political policies. The result was a carefully constructed visual language that was tailored to contemporary aesthetic sensibilities and that enhanced imperial legitimacy through projects such as the Moti Masjid.

Sophia Rose Shafi

Visiting Assistant Professor of Islamic Studies
Iliff School of Theology

"Every Torn Piece of My Heart Becomes a Green Meadow": The History and Religious Function of Aineh-Kari in Persianate Architecture

Shrines at which the Twelve Imams and their relatives are interred function as major sacred sites in Shi'a Islam. These sites, known as *Imamzadeh* and *Ziyarat Gah Moghadas*, are decorated with *aineh-kari*—literally, “mirror-work”—an artistic convention that is also found in homes, palaces, and other non-religious sites. In my paper, I provide a brief history of the origins and use of *aineh-kari* in Persianate architecture. I also illustrate how the geometrically organized pieces of glass that cover the walls and ceilings of shrines in Iraq, Iran, and Syria serve as a means of communicating important religious beliefs. Through my analysis of these texts, including the Qur'an, *ahadith*, and teachings of the *marjah*, it is evident that *aineh-kari* function as an integral part of the religious contemplation that takes place at these shrines. *Aineh-kari* serves an important function in the religious practices of pilgrims by interrupting the mundane and introducing the sacred. Mirror work in Shi'a shrines is more fractured than the examples found in homes and palace architecture and the reason for this stylistic disparity is theological. The appearance of shattered mirrors honors an important concept in Shi'a ritual that suggests a Muslim should not pray in front of his or her own image.

Therefore, in Shi'a shrines, *aineh-kari* takes on the appearance of shattered glass. The concept suggested in this poem: "Because of the beloved's glance every torn piece of my heart became a green meadow, when the mirror shatters it becomes a house of mirrors."

Carol Bier

Research Associate , The Textile Museum

Overlapping Decagons on the Iranian Plateau: History of Architecture and the History of Mathematics

Dan Shechtman received the Nobel Prize in Chemistry (2011) for discovery of a crystalline structure in which five- and ten-fold symmetries are present in a way that is "forbidden" according to the laws of symmetry as understood since the late nineteenth century. Analysis of the three-dimensional structure yields a diffraction pattern that, according to the Nobel award press release, resembles "medieval Islamic mosaics." Similar two-dimensional patterns appear on the Gonbad-e Kabud in Maragha and the Darb-e Imam in Isfahan, which have been analyzed by several authors from different perspectives. Peter Lu and J. Paul Steinhardt published these patterns in *Science* in 2007, generating both international acclaim and controversy. Emil Makovicky, a crystallographer, and Jay Bonner, a designer whose specialty is Islamic ornament, had undertaken analyses of the same patterns in Maragha and Isfahan. For the past decade I, too, have devoted considerable attention to the study of the pattern on the Gonbad-e Kabud at Maragha in which local pentagonal and decagonal symmetries are present on a monument that is decagonal in plan and prismatic in structure. In seeking to contextualize this unique monument, I studied plans, photographs, and inscriptions on pre-Mongol buildings at Kharraqan, Maragha, Nakhchevan, Hamadan, and Isfahan, each of which exhibits overlapping polygons in their exterior ornament. My work strives to arrive at a methodology to interpret the meaning of geometry and is published in several articles that build one upon the other (Bridges conference proceedings [2002; 2011]; *Iranian Studies* 41/4 [2008]; *Nexus: Architecture and Mathematics* [Fall 2012]). Challenging a traditional paradigm that treats these patterns as decorative and ornamental, and based upon geometric analyses and study of inscribed Qur'anic verses, the conclusions I propose establish a new paradigm that relates these patterns in pre-Mongol Iran to then contemporary philosophical discourse and the history of mathematics.

Panel 6

Relocating History: Interventions of Islamic Architecture and Decoration in England, Greece and Cairo

Panel Chair and Discussant, *Nebahat Avcioglu*

Melanie Gibson

School of Oriental and African Studies
London University

Colouring the surface: A Taste for tiles in English Domestic Architecture, 1850-1920

The ceramics of Syria, Turkey and Iran, first seen at a series of international exhibitions held in London and other European capital cities in the second half of the 19th century, had a transformative effect on English domestic production. The subsequent growth in the use of glazed wall-tiles in Victorian domestic architecture seems in part to have been inspired by the Islamic custom of decorative architectural cladding, widely represented by contemporary painters who had travelled in the Middle East and painted scenes of baths and other tiled interiors. This new taste for brightly coloured tiles was both encouraged and satisfied by the products of newly-founded industrial tile manufacturers such as Minton Hollins, and Maw & Co., as well as the craftsman-designer William de Morgan. This paper will trace the history of this development and explore to what extent the Victorian tiles were direct copies of Islamic examples or were simply decorated in an ‘orientalising’ style.

George Manginis

Independent Scholar

Iznik in Athens: Ottoman-style Tile Revetments on inter-war Public Buildings in Greece

The early part of the twentieth century witnessed an intensification of nationalistic sentiment in the Balkans; the dissolution of the Ottoman Empire shifted state boundaries and resulted in dramatic population movements. Armenian and Greek potters working at Kütahya since the nineteenth century in an Iznik revival style had to relocate all over the Balkans. The major move to Greece after 1922 (eloquently described in Greek history books as ‘the Catastrophe’) resulted in the foundation of pottery factories which continued this tradition in the shapes and decorations of their wares. Their principal commissions were Neoclassical but also Ottoman-style tile revetments for Greek state buildings, among them several friezes for the Greek Parliament building (the Old Palace in Athens) and for newly-erected town halls. The latter fashion may at first seem surprising but a careful reading of the buildings and the politics of the time reveals a tangled historical and cultural context.

Anna McSweeney
School of Oriental and African Studies
University of London

The Afterlife of the Alhambra

During the nineteenth century there was a vogue among the elite in Britain and the United States for creating Alhambra style smoking rooms in domestic spaces. These were particularly modelled on the Nasrid style of the Alhambra which had been popularised through the recent publications of Owen Jones.

This fashion for an 'exotic' space is perhaps unsurprising in a western context; but the Alhambra style also became popular in the cities of the Middle East. In Cairo for example, an Alhambra style palace was built on Gezirah island to house European monarchs attending the Suez Canal opening celebrations in 1869.

The Alhambra– and by extension Andalusí architectural style – was appropriated as an acceptable kind of 'pan-Islamic' style by European architects who were working in the Middle East for local rulers. This use of a retrospective and foreign style in a nineteenth-century, Middle Eastern context could also be understood as a nostalgic reference to a 'golden age' of the Islamic caliphate.

Panel 7

Reconstructing Meaning through Historiography and Museology

Panel Chair and Discussant, *Navina Haidar*

Mercedes Volait

CNRS Research Professor

Institut national d'histoire de l'art (INHA)

Monument or Ornament? Early French architectural histories of Islamic buildings in Egypt (1850s-1870s)

In 1869, the French publisher Veuve A. Morel and Co. was engaged in the publication of two parallel works illustrating monuments in Egypt: *Les Arts arabes, architecture, menuiserie, bronzes, plafonds, etc. avec une table descriptive et explicative et le trait général de l'art arabe*, by the architect Jules Bourgoïn (1838-1908) and *L'art arabe d'après les monuments du Kaire depuis le VII^e siècle jusqu'à la fin du XVIII^e siècle* by Emile Prisse d'Avennes (1807-1879), who defined himself as an artist and antiquarian. Resulting from surveys made during the 1850s and 1860s, the books quite differ in their method, scope and philosophy. They represent distinct approaches to Islamic architecture in Egypt that can be broadly summarized as engaging with theory vs. engaging with history. The former publication is driven by a theory of forms and ornament, while the latter belongs to a historiographical genre that was fast developing, that of "monumental history". Their confrontation shows that very different concerns drew (marginalized) scholars towards the studying of Islamic architecture, which may explain the late emergence of the discipline. In their own ways, both publications indeed address issues and topics that are still of relevance to current scholarship of Islamic art and architecture. Furthermore, they share an evolution towards including objects in their perspective that is worth questioning.

Using what remain from the private archives, textual and visual, of both authors, as well as their publications, the paper proposes to discuss the historiographical framework of the parallel works of Bourgoïn and Prisse d'Avennes, assess their contributions to, and limitations in, the understanding of Islamic architecture, and question the role assigned to objects in their interpretations.

Alyson Wharton

Assistant Professor

Mardin Artuklu University, Turkey

The Paradigm of a Favoured Community and Armenians in the History of Islamic Architecture

Armenians have been cited as the architects behind important works of 'Islamic Architecture' and yet we often know little about these individuals so that their role has

taken on an apocryphal quality. An early example is in the work of LA Mayer, *Islamic Architects and Their Works* (Geneva, 1956), in which the author states that the architect of the Gök Medrese in Sivas (670/1271-2), Kaluyan, was Armenian due to the references of “travelers’ accounts”. The Ottoman architects Mimar Sinan and Simyon Kalfa (builder of the Nur-u Osmaniye Mosque), likewise, have patchy documentation concerning their identities, and Mimar Serkis Löle is known to have built a large number of Hamidian-Period works in Mardin but virtually nothing is known about this prolific individual. The only exceptions to these examples of apocryphal Armenians are the members of the Balyan Family, architects of the Ottoman imperial works of the 19th Century. This family has been the subject of monographs, articles and theses- yet even this case has been subjected to continuing speculation.

Armenian sources have not been used effectively by art historians working on these architects. Although 19th and early 20th Century histories emphasize the role of the Balyans as the Muslim ruler’s favoured cohorts, this is a well-worn trope: we have countless Armenian “dynasties” who were allies of Muslim rulers, from the Fatimid Armenian viziers to the Rushtunis, Mamikonians and Bagratids, to the princely Armenian *khodjas* of Safavid New Julfa. Yet this was apparently also a genuine self-perception of these Armenians, who chose to build their churches in the same style as their imperial works.

These sources also move beyond this cliché and provide details on the education, artistic milieus and objectives of these architects, which can provide us with a radically different view of ‘Islamic Architecture’ in the 19th and 20th Century.

Keelan Overton

Curator of Islamic Art, Doris Duke Foundation for Islamic Art

Patterns of Revivalism: The Safavid/Pahlavi Case Study through a Pan-Islamic Lens

During an era in which the definition of Islamic art is gradually being expanded to include the “long nineteenth century” and contemporary art in both “old” and “new” guises, this paper seeks to fill in the gap by considering artistic production during some of the most transformative decades in the history of the Islamic world, c. 1900-40. Unlike studies on revivalism to date, which have tended to focus on individual centers, artists, and architects, this paper uses the collection amassed by a single collector and patron, Doris Duke (1912-93), as a springboard for a multi-regional and multi-media study. In addition to examining Duke’s patronage of revivalist craftsmanship from throughout the Islamic world in the mid-1930s, this study will introduce non-commissioned Iranian works of art in her collection – manuscripts, album paintings, doors, tables – that can be classified as “Safavid revival.” This corpus of custom-made commissions and ready-made objects will subsequently be explored in relation to two primary sources dateable to the early Pahlavi period: the films of Stephen H. Nyman, a technical assistant in the American Institute for Persian Art and Archaeology, and an Isfahani annual documenting the restoration of the city’s Safavid monuments. Building upon this broad array of visual and textual evidence, this paper aims to contextualize the intellectual and economic

climate of early Pahlavi revivalism in relation to contemporary trends throughout the Islamic world. Is it indeed appropriate to speak of Pan-Islamic revivalism in the early twentieth century? If so, what are the cultural, economic, and political circumstances inherent to this phenomenon?

Mirjam Shatanawi

Indonesia and Islamic Art: the historiography of a neglected heritage

A glimpse at the most commonly used survey books of Islamic art and architecture is revealing: none of them devote any attention to Indonesia, the world's largest Muslim country. Likewise, exhibitions of Islamic art in museums, with very few exceptions, stop at the borders of South Asia. The exclusion of Indonesia from the field of Islamic art can be traced back to the late 19th century when Western art historians and museums started to study the artefacts they collected from Muslim regions, and Islamic art as a field of enquiry emerged.

This paper will discuss a collection of objects from Indonesia's Muslim areas to understand the historical conditions leading to the Western disregard of Indonesia's Muslim heritage and to investigate alternative approaches to the concept of 'Islamic art' in an Indonesian context. The objects hail from the majority Muslim islands of Java and Sumatra and were collected for the Colonial Museum (now Tropenmuseum) in Amsterdam. The paper will investigate the various meanings attached to the objects by their Indonesian makers and users and their re-appropriation in the hands of Dutch collectors and museum staff. The central question is how ideas of the 'Islamic' are expressed in and mediated through the object, and then interpreted, defined and classified in practices of museum collecting and interpretation.

In the colonial period, collecting in Dutch museums was strongly influenced by governmental cultural policies that largely overlooked Indonesia's Islamic heritage. The analysis of the Tropenmuseum's collection of artefacts will demonstrate how this particular history has influenced museological perceptions of Muslim Indonesia. Placed in the context of the emerging field of Islamic art, the historiographic analysis of the practices of collecting and exhibiting Indonesian artefacts will shed light on the processes of inclusion and exclusion that were inherent to the formation of Islamic art as an art historical field.

Panel 8

Objectifying the Islamic Object: From Ottoman Silk Flags to Twelfth-century Minbars to a Thirteenth-century Brass Tray with Processional Figures

Panel Chair and Discussant, *Linda Komaroff*

Bernard O’Kane

Professor of Islamic Art and Architecture, American University in Cairo

A Tale of Two Minbars: Woodwork in Egypt and Syria on the Eve of the Ayyubids

The minbars of the Jami‘ al-‘Amri at Qus (550/1155-6) and the Jami‘ Nuri at Hama (559/1163-4) were built within a decade of each other. The first is in Egypt, the product of a Fatimid patron, the second in Syria, commissioned by a Zangid patron. Each deserves a closer look, not only for their intrinsic artistic qualities, which are even more impressive than they have been given credit for, but also for what they reveal of trends in ornamentation at the time.

Prisse d’Avennes was especially impressed with the Qus minbar. He was also able to draw it when it was ostensibly in a more intact state than it is now, showing it with doors, balustrades, and a dome. Fortunately, since the rest has survived virtually intact, we can use it as a control for the accuracy of those parts we have lost. Unfortunately, a close scrutiny quickly reveals that parts of his drawing may be a complete fabrication.

The minbar of Hama has been overshadowed by that ordered five years later by Nur al-Din for the Aqsa mosque. . Its base has been lost, apart from the inscription surrounding the balustrade on one side. But what remains still displays outstanding craftsmanship, including one feature that has not previously been mentioned, painting on the inside of its dome.

The conclusion will discuss what these minbars tell us of the trends in ornamentation at the time. To set up a dichotomy, as some previous scholarship has done, between Syria and Egypt on the basis of their pre-Ayyubid usages of the “giriḥ” mode and the arabesque, is not borne out by the evidence.

Hana Taragan

Tel Aviv University, Israel

‘Figures in Procession’: Thoughts on a Tray Stand from Doha, Qatar

A scene on a brass tray stand in the Doha Museum of Islamic Art, (previously in the Arthur Sambon collection), depicts four figures in procession with one carrying a doe or fawn around his shoulders, the second bearing a falcon, the third a hare, and the fourth a sword or javelin. The figures are approaching the presence of the sultan seated on a lion-throne. The museum has dated the tray stand to the mid-thirteenth century, Syria or the Jazira.

Images of “walking” figures, some carrying live animals, others holding identified or emblematic objects, advancing ceremoniously toward a revealed or “hidden” enthroned ruler also appear on other objects, as for example, on the Baptistere de Saint Louis at the Louvre museum.

Although the image appearing in Islamic art of an enthroned ruler flanked by attendants has been studied from the standpoints of patronage and dating, the phenomenon of figures in procession remains enigmatic and unresolved. Do they depict a specific event that took place in the sultan’s court? Do they represent hunting accompanied by amirs and servants as part of the 'courtly cycle' idea? Or are they following an established tradition of visual rhetoric developed in the East and West of the ruler and his power and sovereignty on earth below with the grace of the heavens above? A sort of visual rhetoric that has also echoes in literary texts of the period.

Barbara Karl

Curator of Textiles and Carpets, MAK – Museum für angewandte Kunst, Vienna

Ottoman silk flags as Objects of Propaganda in the Conflict Between Habsburgs and Ottomans during the 17th and early 18th centuries

In the history of wars of conquest, flags and banners have been treated as bearers of prestige and media for propaganda ever since Antiquity. In the army, flags manifested the rank of the person whose tent they adorned, or the division that bore them at its head. They served furthermore as communicators within the army. The meaning of flags changed according to context: at the moment of conquest they came from being media of organisation and identification within the army to becoming the symbol of dominance and occupation. An example of this is the reported raising of a flag as the first act of the Ottomans when storming the bastions of Vienna during the second siege of 1683. Raising his flag on the fortress was a sign that the occupier had captured it at least symbolically and thus demoralised the enemy.

Vienna’s museums still own over 70 Ottoman flags from three centuries. Most of them were pieces of booty taken during the long wars on the Balkan during the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. For the majority of the flags it is not clear when they were captured. The paper deals with the very few surviving red Ottoman silk flags from the late 17th century that are still extant in Vienna and whose histories can in parts be reconstructed. Masterworks of weaving these sumptuous flags bore important messages and played a vital role not only in the camps of the Ottoman army. The flags captured in the Viennese context could scarcely avoid being instrumentalised for political and religious purposes by the King, of Poland, the Emperor and the Pope. The objective of this paper is to show not only the origins and contents of the Ottoman silk flags but also how effectively they were used in the context of anti-Ottoman propaganda and the Habsburg memoria cult until well into the nineteenth century.